



July 5, 2021

(By Electronic Transmission)

Ms Deidre McCartney
City of Alameda Planning and Building Department
2263 Santa Clara Avenue
Alameda, California 94501

Subject:—Design Review for 2425 Cement Av - - PLN21-0153

Dear Ms. McCartney:

Major construction has already occurred at the project site, including removal of previously existing front elevation windows and covering of side elevations in lower front elevation with Tyvek insulation. This exceeds the scope of issued Building permit CB20-0224. See attached July 4 photographs. **A stop work order should be issued and remain in place until all design review approvals and related building permits have been issued.**

The Alameda Architectural Preservation Society (AAPS) has the following comments on the proposed plans:

- 1) The existing front elevation surface materials including all of the existing first floor wood shingles, attic vent, raking eaves, brackets and trim elements should be retained and incorporated into the plans. Instead, the plans proposed to replace most of the existing wood shingles with lap siding and do not show the attic vent (although the front elevation rendering does show the vent) which is an important character-defining feature.

Unfortunately, the pre-existing first floor ca. 1 x 6 window casings and window sills appear to have already been removed, apparently without permit. The pre-existing casings and sills should be incorporated into the project to match the removed casings, including the moldings around the casing perimeters. The casings and sills for the new lower floor's proposed front elevation windows and casings and entry door casings should also match the pre-existing.

Note: the proposed casings are only 1 x 4 rather than the pre-existing ca.1 x 6 and lack the perimeter moldings. In addition, the existing front elevation shown on Sheet A1.2 incorrectly shows the front elevation surfaces to be all stucco, rather than the actual wood shingles with horizontal wood siding at the basement level, and do not show the existing brackets, attic vent and other details.

- 2) The window schedule does not accurately represent the existing and proposed front elevation windows and should be corrected. It appears that the intent is to retain the pre-existing three part window configuration (fixed or awning “picture” center sash flanked by double hung or single hung sash) and use the same configuration on the lower level and provide an individual single hung or double hung window on the upper level’s right side, all of which is good.

The proposed Milgard ultra fiberglass window sash are available in several colors. The front elevation windows rendering shows black or other dark colored sash, which would be good and should be specified on the plans.

Each sash within the three part windows should have a vertical wood-surfaced separation at least 5 1/2 inches wide.

- 3) Although the existing front elevation wood shingles should be retained on the upper level, horizontal siding that visually matches wood siding, such as the proposed composite lap siding, is appropriate for the lower level. However, the exposure (9 inch, 6 inch, etc.) for the composite lap siding should be indicated.

The composite siding should be smooth surface with no raised imitation wood grain.

- 4) The proposed brackets under the front door hood should be at least 3 1/2 inches thick.
- 5) The new front door design should be clearly indicated. A Craftsman design (such as that incorrectly shown for the existing front elevation) would work well with the building’s Craftsman architecture.

Given the inaccuracies and ambiguities noted in items 1 and 2 above, the application is “incomplete” and was not ready for public noticing.

Please provide us copies of any decision letters or other important correspondence concerning this project and any notices of plan revisions. Please either send these materials to me directly at 1017 San Antonio Avenue or to cbuckleyaicp@att.net.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment. Please contact me at 510-523-0411 or cbuckleyaicp@att.net if you have questions or would like to discuss these comments.

Sincerely,

Christopher Buckley, Chair
Preservation Action Committee
Alameda Architectural Preservation Society

Attachments: July 4 photos showing removed front elevation widows and partial siding removal and extant architectural details

cc: Allen Tai and Andrew Thomas (by electronic transmission)
Planning Board (by electronic transmission)
AAPS Board and Preservation Action Committee (by electronic transmission)